

An executive summary for tackling global challenges

# **FACT SHEET:**

# **Indicators for Selected Post-2015 Targets**

This paper provides evidence-based recommendations on indicators for the post-2015 targets proposed by the UN Open Working Group on Sustainable Development Goals (OWG).¹ It complements the Technical report by the Bureau of the United Nations Statistical Commission (UNSC) on the process of the development of an indicator framework for the goals and targets of the post-2015 development agenda.²

Global2015 recommends the following indicators to be included. We focus on topics that emerge from limited access to vital resources and show the highest impacts on human development in terms of loss of life, health losses, affected natural resources or economic losses. The selection of topics is based on publicly available data on deaths, lost DALYs (disability-adjusted life-years), affected people, affected natural resources, and economic losses from UN organizations and academia, such as the WHO Global Health Estimates 2014 and the IHME Global Burden of Disease (GBD) study 2015.

# Target 2.1

By 2030, end hunger and ensure access by all people, in particular the poor and people in vulnerable situations, including infants, to safe, nutritious and sufficient food all year round<sup>3</sup>

# **Indicator 2.1.1**

#### Prevalence of Food Inadequacy (FAO)

This indicator refers to a "normal physical activity level", and is therefore more realistic and appropriate than the Prevalence of Undernourishment (PoU) which assumes a "sedentary lifestyle". "Many poor and hungry people are likely to have livelihoods involving arduous manual labour" (FAO et al.).<sup>4</sup> Therefore, the Prevalence of Food Inadequacy should replace PoU, or at least be used together with PoU.

<sup>1</sup> OWG: Open Working Group proposal for Sustainable Development Goals, 2014, pp. 7–24. (https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/content/documents/1579SDGs%20Proposal.pdf).

<sup>2</sup> Link: http://unngls.org/images/PDF/Technical\_report\_of\_the\_UNSC\_Bureau\_final.pdf.

<sup>3</sup> OWG: Open Working Group proposal for Sustainable Development Goals, 2014, 8 (for the link, see note 1 above).

<sup>4</sup> FAO et al.: The State of Food Insecurity in the World 2012, 12 (box 1) (http://www.fao.org/3/a-i3027e.pdf).

Rating: the same as PoU (BAA), or better (even more relevant).

Data: FAO: Food Insecurity Indicators, 2014.5

## **Indicator 2.1.3 (new)**

#### Additional indicator: Number of deaths from undernutrition

This indicator shows the severity of undernourishment, and therefore adds high relevance. Estimates of deaths due to undernutrition originating in childhood were released by the GBD study, Black et al. and the WHO. The GBD study provided data for 21 regions and will regularly provide updates, likely also for the country level. There is collaboration between the WHO and the GBD study, which could be extended to deliver data for the UN SDG monitoring. However, as of now, no data is available on the health impacts of undernutrition that occurs in people from five years onwards.

*Rating:* For the above-mentioned reasons, the rating should be at least similar to Indicator 2.1.1 (BAA). *Data:* Black et al.: Maternal and child undernutrition and overweight in low-income and middle-income countries, 2013,<sup>6</sup> pp. 433, 442; GBD study: S. S. Lim et al.: A comparative risk assessment of burden of disease and injury attributable to 67 risk factors and risk factor clusters in 21 regions, 1990-2010: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2010,<sup>7</sup> p. 2238 [an update has been

announced, probably providing data at country level]; WHO: Global Health Risks, 2009.8

# Target 2.2

By 2030, end all forms of malnutrition, including achieving, by 2025, the internationally agreed targets on stunting and wasting in children under 5 years of age, and address the nutritional needs of adolescent girls, pregnant and lactating women and older persons<sup>9</sup>

## Indicators 2.2.3–4 (new)

#### Additional indicators:

#### Number of deaths from vitamin A and zinc deficiencies

#### Number of deaths from maternal iron-deficiency

Target 2.2 mainly strives to "end all forms of malnutrition" by 2030, but the indicators cover only a part of the topic. Data is available from Black et al. and the GBD study, taking into account vitamin A deficiency and zinc deficiency.

The target also strives to "address the nutritional needs of adolescent girls, pregnant and lactating

<sup>5</sup> Link: <a href="http://www.fao.org/fileadmin/templates/ess/foodsecurity/Food\_Security\_Indicators.xlsx">http://www.fao.org/fileadmin/templates/ess/foodsecurity/Food\_Security\_Indicators.xlsx</a>.

<sup>6</sup> In: The Lancet 2013, Vol. 382, Issue 9890 (http://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736(13)60937-X/fulltext).

<sup>7</sup> In: The Lancet 2012, Vol. 380, Issue 9859 (http://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736%2812%2961766-8/fulltext).

<sup>8</sup> Link: http://www.who.int/healthinfo/global burden disease/GlobalHealthRisks report full.pdf.

<sup>9</sup> OWG: Open Working Group proposal for Sustainable Development Goals, 2014, 8 (for the link, see note 1 above).

women", but no indicator refers to this. Data is available on maternal iron deficiency (fetal growth restriction) (Black et al. 2013, 427, 430–431; GBD study, 2228, 2238, 2241, 2243–2245, 2250).

These micronutrient deficiencies ("hidden hunger") are already taken into account in the newly proposed Indicator 2.1.3 (number of deaths from undernutrition). However, due to the methodology of risk attribution, the figures cannot be added or subtracted. The overlap should be stated in a note attached to the indicator. However, if such overlap should be avoided, there should be a note provided to Target 2.2 stating that vitamin and mineral deficiencies, including maternal iron-deficiency, are already taken into account in Indicator 2.1.3.

Rating: the same as the other indicators (BAA).

*Data:* Black et al.: Maternal and child undernutrition and overweight in low-income and middle-income countries, 2013,<sup>10</sup> pp. 433–434, 440–442, 427, 430–431, 444–445; GBD study: S. S. Lim et al.: A comparative risk assessment of burden of disease and injury attributable to 67 risk factors and risk factor clusters in 21 regions, 1990-2010: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2010, 2012,<sup>11</sup> pp. 2228, 2238, 2225, 2241–48, 2250–53 [an update has been announced, probably providing data at country level].

# Targets 3.2 and 3.3

By 2030, end preventable deaths of newborns and children under 5 years of age

By 2030, end the epidemics of AIDS, tuberculosis, malaria and neglected tropical diseases and combat hepatitis, water-borne diseases and other communicable diseases<sup>12</sup>

These two targets are the SDG targets with the greatest impact in terms of reducing mortality. <sup>13</sup> Accordingly, the indicators for these two targets are of utmost importance in order to track progress.

### Indicators 3.2.1, 3.3.2 and 3.3.6

#### **Numbers of deaths** (instead of mortality rates, or additionally)

As is already the case with Indicator 3.3.4 (tuberculosis), the indicators should be expressed in numbers of deaths instead of the mortality rate, in order to ease understanding and to be more compelling (as suggested by Norheim et al.<sup>14</sup>). Many SDG Targets, including Target 3.2, refer to deaths and not to mortality rates (Targets 3.2, 3.6, 3.9, 11.5). For these reasons, the indicators should only use mortality rates if the target itself includes a target level expressed in terms of mortality rate. Alternatively, all death-related targets should use both numbers of deaths and mortality rates.

<sup>10</sup> In: The Lancet 2013, Vol. 382, Issue 9890 (http://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736(13)60937-X/fulltext).

<sup>11</sup> In: The Lancet 2012, Vol. 380, Issue 9859 (for the link, see note 7 above).

<sup>12</sup> OWG: Open Working Group proposal for Sustainable Development Goals, 2014, 9 (for the link, see note 1 above).

<sup>13</sup> See our fact sheet on infectious diseases, p. 1 (<a href="http://global2015.de/file/global2015sdg3-3.pdf">http://global2015.de/file/global2015sdg3-3.pdf</a>), based on the WHO Global Health Estimates and the GBD study.

<sup>14</sup> In: The Lancet 2015, Vol. 385, Issue 9964 (http://www.thelancet.com/journals/lancet/article/PIIS0140-6736(14)61591-9/fulltext).

# Indicator 3.3.2a (new)

## Additional indicator: **HIV/AIDS antiretroviral therapy coverage**

In order to complete unfinished business from the MDG target on universal access to treatment of HIV/AIDS, and to end the AIDS epidemic, this is an essential indicator. Nevertheless, the two indicators on new HIV cases and AIDS deaths cannot serve as a complete replacement, because they do not reflect the treatment of people who will need it on the way to 2030.

Rating: the same as the other two indicators on HIV/AIDS (AAA).

*Data:* UNAIDS: Global AIDS Response Progress Reporting 2015;<sup>15</sup> WHO: Global update on the health sector response to HIV, 2014;<sup>16</sup> WB: World Development Indicators (WDI), "Antiretroviral therapy coverage (% of people living with HIV)".<sup>17</sup>

## Indicator 3.3.4a (new)

## Additional indicator: Number of deaths from multi-drug resistant tuberculosis (MDR-TB)

The relevance of this indicator stems from the fact that MDR-TB is increasing, has high fatality rates, and, moreover, it will not be possible to end the epidemic of tuberculosis without defeating MDR-TB.

Rating: BAA. Strong efforts are under way to make data collection more comprehensive.

*Data:* WHO: Global Tuberculosis Report 2014, <sup>18</sup> chap. 5; WHO: Antimicrobial resistance, 2014, <sup>19</sup> section 4.1.

### **Indicator 3.3.7a (new)**

### Additional indicator: Number of deaths from viral hepatitis

This indicator is of high relevance since, if current trends continue, hepatitis will be the most fatal epidemic in the post-2015 era. The SDG indicators should track the goal of Target 3.3 to combat hepatitis. Data is available from the WHO Global Health Estimates 2014 (for acute hepatitis B and C) and the IHME Global Burden of Disease (GBD) study 2015 (for acute hepatitis A, B, C and E, as well as for liver cancer and liver cirrhosis resulting from chronic hepatitis B and C, disaggregated for 188 countries).

*Rating:* AAA. There is collaboration between the WHO and the GBD study, which could be extended to deliver data for the UN SDG monitoring. Hence, the rating should be similar to the other diseases included in Target 3.3 (AAA).

Data: WHO: Global Health Estimates 2014;<sup>20</sup> GBD study, 2014/2015.<sup>21</sup>

<sup>15</sup> Link: http://www.unaids.org/sites/default/files/media asset/JC2702 GARPR2015guidelines en.pdf.

<sup>16</sup> Link: http://www.who.int/iris/bitstream/10665/128494/1/9789241507585\_eng.pdf?ua=1.

<sup>17</sup> Link: <a href="http://data.worldbank.org/">http://data.worldbank.org/</a>.

<sup>18</sup> Link: <a href="http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/10665/137094/1/9789241564809">http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/10665/137094/1/9789241564809</a> eng.pdf?ua=1.

<sup>19</sup> Link: http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/10665/112642/1/9789241564748\_eng.pdf.

<sup>20</sup> Link: http://www.who.int/healthinfo/global burden disease/estimates/en/index1.html.

<sup>21</sup> Link: http://www.healthdata.org/gbd.

## **Indicator 3.3.9 (new)**

#### Additional indicator: Number of deaths from other communicable diseases

In order to cover Target 3.3 entirely, an indicator on the remaining contagious diseases should be added. This indicator would be highly relevant because it includes pneumonia, which is likely to cause the highest number of deaths out of all infectious diseases for both children and the total population. (according to WHO 2014<sup>22</sup>). The indicator should also take into account neglected tropical diseases and water-borne diseases, with the exception of malaria (i.e. comprising all contagious diseases except those covered by the other indicators: HIV/AIDS, tuberculosis, malaria, and hepatitis).

Rating: the same as the communicable diseases covered by the other indicators included (AAA).

Data: WHO: Global Health Estimates 2014;<sup>23</sup> GBD study, 2014/2015.<sup>24</sup>

# Target 3.8

Achieve universal health coverage, including financial risk protection, access to quality essential health-care services and access to safe, effective, quality and affordable essential medicines and vaccines for  $al^{25}$ 

# Indicator 3.8.2-3 (new)

#### Additional indicators:

## Median availability of selected generic medicines (WHO)

#### Physicians per 1000 people (WB)

These indicators refer to a part of the target that is not covered by the two indicators on financial risk protection, and are relevant because of large limitations in access to essential medicines and health services.

Rating: ABA to BBB for essential medicines, and ABA to ABB for physicians, respectively (at least as high as the two other indicators [BBB and CBB], due to better feasibility).

*Data:* WHO: Median availability of selected generic medicines;<sup>26</sup> WB: WDI, "Physicians (per 1,000 people)".<sup>27</sup>

<sup>22</sup> WHO: Global Health Estimates 2014 (<a href="http://www.who.int/healthinfo/global\_burden\_disease/GHE\_DthGlobal\_2000\_2012.xls">http://www.who.int/healthinfo/global\_burden\_disease/GHE\_DthGlobal\_2000\_2012.xls</a>) (pneumonia is the predominant part of lower respiratory infections).

<sup>23</sup> Link: <a href="http://www.who.int/healthinfo/global-burden-disease/estimates/en/index1.html">http://www.who.int/healthinfo/global-burden-disease/estimates/en/index1.html</a>.

<sup>24</sup> Link: http://www.healthdata.org/gbd.

<sup>25</sup> OWG: Open Working Group proposal for Sustainable Development Goals, 2014, 9 (for the link, see note 1 above).

<sup>26</sup> Link: <a href="http://www.who.int/gho/mdg/medicines/availability/en/">http://www.who.int/gho/mdg/medicines/availability/en/</a>.

<sup>27</sup> Link: <a href="http://data.worldbank.org/">http://data.worldbank.org/</a>.

# Target 3.9

By 2030, substantially reduce the number of deaths and illnesses from hazardous chemicals and air, water and soil pollution and contamination

## Indicators 3.9.2-5 (new)

#### Additional indicators:

Number of deaths from lead exposure

Number of deaths from outdoor (ambient) air pollution

Number of deaths from indoor (household) air pollution

Number of deaths from water contamination (alternatively: deaths from diarrhoeal diseases)

These indicators entail the available data for the topics listed in Target 3.9. The currently suggested indicator is very incomplete in fully addressing the target.

Data is provided by the WHO and the GBD study. The relevance of these indicators is very high, since they reflect some of the topics that are the biggest killers. Outdoor air pollution claims more than 3 million lives per year, a figure that is increasing (WHO; GBD study).

The biggest impacts of water pollution are infections and deaths from diarrhoeal diseases. Since there are very different estimates on the mortality attributable to the risk factor unsafe water and sanitation, data on diarrhoeal diseases could be used instead.

*Rating:* BAA (at the regional and global level, AAA). There is collaboration between the WHO and the GBD study, which could be extended to deliver data for the UN SDG monitoring. Hence, the rating should be similar to the diseases included in Target 3.3 (AAA).

*Data:* WHO: Burden of disease from ambient and household air pollution, 2014;<sup>28</sup> WHO: Preventing diarrhoea through better water, sanitation and hygiene: exposures and impacts in low- and middle-income countries, 2014;<sup>29</sup> GBD study: S. S. Lim et al.: A comparative risk assessment of burden of disease and injury attributable to 67 risk factors and risk factor clusters in 21 regions, 1990-2010: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2010, 2012,<sup>30</sup> p. 2238 [covering lead exposure, ambient air pollution, household air pollution, and unsafe water; an update has been announced, probably providing data at country level]; on diarrhoeal diseases: WHO: Global Health Estimates 2014;<sup>31</sup> GBD study, 2014/2015.<sup>32</sup>

<sup>28</sup> Link: <a href="http://www.who.int/phe/health-topics/outdoorair/databases/en/">http://www.who.int/phe/health-topics/outdoorair/databases/en/</a>.

<sup>29</sup> Link: http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/10665/150112/1/9789241564823 eng.pdf?ua=1/&ua=1.

<sup>30</sup> In: The Lancet 2012, Vol. 380, Issue 9859 (for the link, see note 7 above).

<sup>31</sup> Link: http://www.who.int/healthinfo/global burden disease/estimates/en/index1.html.

<sup>32</sup> Link: http://www.healthdata.org/gbd.

# Target 5.2

Eliminate all forms of violence against all women and girls in the public and private spheres, including trafficking and sexual and other types of exploitation<sup>33</sup>

# **Indicator 5.2.3 (new)**

# Additional indicator: Number of deaths from physical and/or sexual violence by a current or former intimate partner

This indicator should be added in order to reflect the most severe outcomes of violence against women and girls. Data is available from the GBD study.

Rating: BAA (similar to the other indicators, but currently only at the regional and global level).

*Data:* GBD study: S. S. Lim et al.: A comparative risk assessment of burden of disease and injury attributable to 67 risk factors and risk factor clusters in 21 regions, 1990-2010: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2010, 2012,<sup>34</sup> pp. 2240, 2243, 2233 [covering intimate partner violence; an update has been announced, perhaps providing data at country level].

# Target 8.1

Sustain per capita economic growth in accordance with national circumstances and, in particular, at least 7 per cent gross domestic product growth per annum in the least developed countries

# **Indicator 8.1.3 (new)**

#### Additional indicator: GDP growth (based on constant US or constant international dollars)

Indicator 8.1.1 covers the first part of the target (per capita growth) but not the quantified target level stated in the latter part (7% GDP growth in LDCs). The latter part does not refer to per capita growth; instead, it refers to countries and their GDP growth. The 7% minimum target is slightly above the GDP growth rates of the least developed countries (as a total), but much higher than their per capita GDP growth. Annual GDP growth was 4.0–9.0% between 2005 and 2013 in the least developed countries (as a total), if GDP expressed in constant US\$. If based on purchasing power parity (PPP, constant international dollars), growth was between 3.5% and 8.5%. Per capita GDP only grew by 1.7–6.5% per year in the same time frame, if based on constant US\$, or 1.2–6.0%, if based on constant PPP \$.

Rating: the same as for Indicator 8.1.1 (AAA).

Data: WB: WDI, "GDP growth (annual %)" or "GDP, PPP (constant 2011 international \$)".35

<sup>33</sup> OWG: Open Working Group proposal for Sustainable Development Goals, 2014, 11 (for the link, see note 1 above).

<sup>34</sup> In: The Lancet 2012, Vol. 380, Issue 9859 (for the link, see note 7 above).

<sup>35</sup> Link: <a href="http://data.worldbank.org/">http://data.worldbank.org/</a> [for comparison: "GDP per capita growth (annual %)" and "GDP per capita, PPP (constant 2011 international \$)"; review's calculations of annual percentages for "GDP, PPP" and "GDP per capita, PPP"].

# Target 8.4

Improve progressively, through 2030, global resource efficiency in consumption and production and endeavour to decouple economic growth from environmental degradation, in accordance with the 10-year framework of programmes on sustainable consumption and production, with developed countries taking the lead

#### **Indicator 8.4.1**

#### Global, regional and national material efficiency

The target refers to "global resource efficiency"; therefore, the indicator should not be limited to "national material efficiency". Data is available for the global level and 6 world regions (UNEP; Schaffartzik et al.).

Rating: BBA to BBB (only available at the global and regional level).

*Data:* UNEP: Decoupling Natural Resource Use and Environmental Impacts from Economic Growth. 2011,<sup>36</sup> 11; Schaffartzik et al.: The global metabolic transition: Regional patterns and trends of global material flows, 1950–2010, 2014.<sup>37</sup>

## Indicators 8.4.3-4 (new)

#### Additional indicators:

# Carbon efficiency (the amount of CO<sub>2</sub> emissions per unit of economic output) Water intensity (the amount of freshwater withdrawals per unit of economic output)

The target strives to improve resource efficiency and decouple economic growth from environmental degradation, but the indicators only refer to resource efficiency. In order to reflect the decoupling of economic growth from environmental degradation, more dimensions need to be encompassed. Data is available at all levels to show trends in decoupling of real GDP growth from CO<sub>2</sub> emissions and freshwa-

Rating: ABA to BBB. The indicators are more feasible than the other two indicators (CBB).

*Data:* WB: WDI, "CO<sub>2</sub> emissions (kg per 2011 PPP \$ of GDP)"; "Annual freshwater withdrawals, total (billion cubic meters)"; "GDP, PPP (constant 2011 international \$)"; not in PPP \$, and reversed: "Water productivity, total (constant 2005 US\$ GDP per cubic meter of total freshwater withdrawal)". 38

ter withdrawals (on freshwater withdrawals, only for 2013 and less completely for several earlier years).

<sup>36</sup> Link: http://www.unep.org/resourcepanel/decoupling/files/pdf/decoupling\_report\_english.pdf.

<sup>37</sup> Link: http://www.uni-klu.ac.at/socec/inhalt/5394.htm.

<sup>38</sup> Link: <a href="http://data.worldbank.org/">http://data.worldbank.org/</a>.

# Target 8.8

Protect labour rights and promote safe and secure working environments for all workers, including migrant workers, in particular women migrants, and those in precarious employment<sup>39</sup>

## **Indicator 8.8.1**

Frequency rates of fatal and non-fatal occupational injuries and diseases and time lost due to occupational injuries and diseases by gender (alternatively: Number of deaths from occupational accidents and diseases)

Occupational diseases constitute a major, if not the largest, part of work-related health impacts. Data on deaths from occupational accidents and diseases is available from the ILO, TUT et al. and the GBD study (the latter disaggregated for 21 regions, probably soon also for countries).

Rating: AAA (global and regional) to BAA (national).

*Data:* ILO: Safety and Health at Work: A Vision for Sustainable Prevention,<sup>40</sup> pp. 33–34; TUT et al.: Global Estimates of Occupational Accidents and Work-related Illness 2014,<sup>41</sup> p. 13 [same figures]; GBD study: S. S. Lim et al.: A comparative risk assessment of burden of disease and injury attributable to 67 risk factors and risk factor clusters in 21 regions, 1990-2010: a systematic analysis for the Global Burden of Disease Study 2010, 2012,<sup>42</sup> pp. 2239–2240 [covering occupational risks; an update has been announced, probably providing data at country level].

# Target 9.4

By 2030, upgrade infrastructure and retrofit industries to make them sustainable, with increased resource-use efficiency and greater adoption of clean and environmentally sound technologies and industrial processes, with all countries taking action in accordance with their respective capabilities<sup>43</sup>

## **Indicators 9.4.1 and 9.4.2**

Intensity of material use per unit of value added (international dollars) [no change proposed].

Energy intensity per unit of value added (international dollars) [no change proposed].

*Rating:* may be better than CBB and BBB, respectively, since data is available for material intensity at the global and regional level, and for energy intensity (or for energy productivity) at all levels.

<sup>39</sup> OWG: Open Working Group proposal for Sustainable Development Goals, 2014, 14 (for the link, see note 1 above).

<sup>40</sup> Link: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/--ed\_protect/---protrav/---safework/documents/publication/wcms\_301214.pdf.

<sup>41</sup> Link: http://www.researchgate.net/profile/Jukka Takala/publication/265214122 Global Estimates of Occupational Accidents and Work-related Illnesses 2014 made for the ILO Report at XX World Congress Frankfurt/links/540586480cf23d9765a6f87a.pdf.

<sup>42</sup> In: The Lancet 2012, Vol. 380, Issue 9859 (for the link, see note 7 above).

<sup>43</sup> OWG: Open Working Group proposal for Sustainable Development Goals, 2014, 15 (for the link, see note 1 above).

*Data:* Schaffartzik et al.: The global metabolic transition: Regional patterns and trends of global material flows, 1950–2010, 2014;<sup>44</sup> Krausmann et al.: Growth in global materials use, GDP and population during the 20th century (update 2011), Version 1.2,<sup>45</sup> sheet "Energy flow data"; WB: WDI, "Gross value added at factor cost (constant 2005 US\$)" (also sectoral), "Energy use (kt of oil equivalent)".<sup>46</sup>

# **Target 10.5**

Improve the regulation and monitoring of global financial markets and institutions and strengthen the implementation of such regulations<sup>47</sup>

# Indicators 10.5.2-3 (new)

#### Additional indicators:

Implementation of Basel III requirements (in % of jurisdictions, or as % of progress towards the final requirement levels)

Overall shortfall of banks for the Basel III minimum requirements for capital, liquidity and stable funding (in €, or in % of requirements) [alternatively: Bank capital to assets ratio (%), Bank liquid reserves to bank assets ratio (%)]

The Basel III agreements include milestones to strengthen financial stability, such as to raise different minimum capital requirements for banks in annual steps from 8% to 10.5–13% of total capital asset value by 2019 (BCBS). Against these minimum requirements, the actual equity of banks is assessed regularly, and the total capital shortfall of banks is established (in €). Similarly, the Basel III requirements for the minimum liquidity ratio and stable funding ratio of banks are taken into account (expressed in %). As an alternative, World Bank indicators on the capital and liquidity ratio are available (from global to national level).

Rating: AAA. Data is available from the Basel Committee on Banking Supervision (BCBS), which is located at the Bank for International Settlements (BIS), as well as from the World Bank (WB).

Data: BCBS: Seventh progress report on adoption of the Basel regulatory framework, Oct. 2014;<sup>48</sup> BCBS: Basel III Monitoring Report, March 2015;<sup>49</sup> WB: WDI, "Bank capital to assets ratio (%)", "Bank liquid reserves to bank assets ratio (%)".<sup>50</sup>

<sup>44</sup> Link: <a href="http://www.uni-klu.ac.at/socec/inhalt/5394.htm">http://www.uni-klu.ac.at/socec/inhalt/5394.htm</a>.

<sup>45</sup> Link: http://www.uni-klu.ac.at/socec/downloads/Online\_data\_global\_flows\_update\_2011.xls.

<sup>46</sup> Link: <a href="http://data.worldbank.org/">http://data.worldbank.org/</a>.

<sup>47</sup> OWG: Open Working Group proposal for Sustainable Development Goals, 2014, 16 (for the link, see note 1 above).

<sup>48</sup> Link: http://www.bis.org/publ/bcbs290.pdf.

<sup>49</sup> Link: http://www.bis.org/bcbs/publ/d312.pdf.

<sup>50</sup> Link: http://data.worldbank.org/.

# **Target 11.5**

By 2030, significantly reduce the number of deaths and the number of people affected and decrease by [x] per cent the economic losses relative to gross domestic product caused by disasters, including water-related disasters, with a focus on protecting the poor and people in vulnerable situations<sup>51</sup>

## Indicator 11.5.3 (new)

Additional indicator: Number of people killed by disasters

Indicator 11.5.1 lists people killed and people affected; it should be two separate indicators. The target strives to reduce the number of deaths, which needs to be measured. For data, see below.

# Indicator 11.5.4 (new)

Additional indicator: Economic losses from disasters relative to GDP (in %)

As the target strives to "decrease ... the economic losses relative to gross domestic product", an appropriate indicator is required. Data on economic losses from damage to property, crops and livestock is available from the CRED EM-DAT database, which was created with initial support by the WHO and has partnerships with the IFRC, UNISDR, USAID, UNEP, Munich Re, etc. The data on economic losses does not need to be adjusted for inflation if referred to nominal GDP, since the resulting percentage is directly comparable across different years. The EM-DAT database provides data at country level. However, completeness of economic losses data may need improvement at this level.

Rating: the same as the other indicators (BBA).

Data: CRED: EM-DAT; Advanced Search<sup>52</sup> [damage in current US\$]; WB: WDI, "GDP (current US\$)".<sup>53</sup>

<sup>51</sup> OWG: Open Working Group proposal for Sustainable Development Goals, 2014, 17 (for the link, see note 1 above).

<sup>52</sup> Link: <a href="http://www.emdat.be/advanced\_search/index.html">http://www.emdat.be/advanced\_search/index.html</a>.

<sup>53</sup> Link: <a href="http://data.worldbank.org/">http://data.worldbank.org/</a>.

# **Target 12.1**

Implement the 10-year framework of programmes on sustainable consumption and production, all countries taking action, with developed countries taking the lead, taking into account the development and capabilities of developing countries<sup>54</sup>

# Indicator 12.1.3 (new)

## Additional indicator: Number of jobs in sustainable consumption and production

The 10-year framework of programmes on sustainable consumption and production (SCP) aims to accelerate the shift towards SCP, while creating new job/market opportunities (UNEP).<sup>55</sup> This should lead to more jobs in SCP. The indicator is outcome-oriented and would complement the two input-related indicators.

*Rating:* BAA to BBB. The indicator is at least as feasible and relevant as the other two indicators, and likely more suitable than these (BBB and CBB).

*Data:* ILO/UNEP: Working towards sustainable development: Opportunities for decent work and social inclusion in a green economy, 2014;<sup>56</sup> UNEP/ILO/IOE/ITUC: Green Jobs Initiative, 2008.<sup>57</sup>

# **Target 13.2**

Integrate climate change measures into national policies, strategies and planning<sup>58</sup>

## Indicator 13.2.2 (new)

Additional indicator: Rate of improvement in carbon productivity (the amount of economic output achieved for a given amount of CO<sub>2</sub> emission)

The target strives to integrate climate change measures into national policies, strategies and planning, the success of which would result in a gradual improvement of the ratio between real GDP and carbon dioxide emissions. GDP should be expressed in constant international dollars (in order to adjust for inflation). This indicator is similar to Indicator 7.b.1 (rate of improvement in energy productivity). It does not imply a requirement to reduce CO<sub>2</sub> emissions; instead it provides room for economic growth and development. The indicator is outcome-oriented and would complement input-related Indicator 13.2.1. Data is available from global to national levels.

<sup>54</sup> OWG: Open Working Group proposal for Sustainable Development Goals, 2014, 18 (for the link, see note 1 above).

<sup>55</sup> UNEP: The 10 Year Framework of Programmes on Sustainable Consumption and Production, 2012, 2 (http://www.unep.org/resourceefficiency/Portals/24147/scp/10yfp/document/Brochure 10YFP -071212 Final.pdf).

<sup>56</sup> Link: http://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---dgreports/---dcomm/---publ/documents/publication/wcms\_181836.pdf.

<sup>57</sup> Link: www.unep.org/PDF/UNEPGreenJobs report08.pdf.

<sup>58</sup> OWG: Open Working Group proposal for Sustainable Development Goals, 2014, 19 (for the link, see note 1 above).

Rating: ABA. The similar Indicator, 7.b.1, is rated BBA, but for both indicators feasibility is good.

*Data:* WB: WDI, "CO<sub>2</sub> emissions (kg per 2011 PPP \$ of GDP)"<sup>59</sup> [the indicator would entail the annual rate of change of the reverse of this data].

# **Target 15.2**

By 2020, promote the implementation of sustainable management of all types of forests, halt deforestation, restore degraded forests and increase afforestation and reforestation by [x] per cent globally<sup>60</sup>

## Indicator 15.2.3 (new)

Additional indicator: Area of planted forest

The target strives for a certain increase of afforestation and reforestation, but no indicator has been proposed to assess this. Data is available on the area of planted forest (in hectares).

Rating: similar to the other two indicators (BBB or BBA).

Data: FAO: Global Forest Resources Assessment 2010,61 94 (table 5.5) [updates: every 5 years].

# **Target 17.18**

By 2020, enhance capacity-building support to developing countries, including for least developed countries and small island developing States, to increase significantly the availability of high-quality, timely and reliable data disaggregated by income, gender, age, race, ethnicity, migratory status, disability, geographic location and other characteristics relevant in national contexts

## Indicator 17.18.3 (new)

Additional indicator: Overall level of statistical capacity (WB)

The two indicators cover activities to enhance capacity-building, but not the resulting capacities. Data for low and middle-income countries is available through a composite indicator developed by the World Bank.

Rating: the same as the other two indicators (AAA).

Data: WB: WDI, "Overall level of statistical capacity (scale 0 – 100)".62

<sup>59</sup> Link: <a href="http://data.worldbank.org/">http://data.worldbank.org/</a>.

<sup>60</sup> OWG: Open Working Group proposal for Sustainable Development Goals, 2014, 21 (for the link, see note 1 above).

<sup>61</sup> Link: http://www.fao.org/docrep/013/i1757e/i1757e.pdf.

<sup>62</sup> Link: http://data.worldbank.org/.

#### **Annotations**

For numeric names the short scale is used: 1 billion = one thousand million =  $10^9 = 1\,000\,000\,000$ .

All numbers are shown to three significant digits, if available (no matter if and where the decimal point may appear). This keeps the rounding error below  $\pm 0.5\%$ . Nevertheless, all calculations are based on unrounded numbers.

#### **Publication and Contact Details**

Global2015, Berlin, 27 April 2015. © Copyright Global2015 e.V. Terms and conditions: <a href="www.Global2015.net/terms.html#copyright">www.Global2015.net/terms.html#copyright</a> Acknowledgements for research, statistics and editing: Marie-Eve Bedard MA, Camilla Casarotto BA(Hons), Meenal Joshi M.Sc., Dipl.-Pol. Lars Vogelsang (concept and coordination), Michael Bradford Wiley BA and those who contributed to previous Global2015 research.

Download: <a href="https://www.global2015.net/file/global2015sdg\_indicators.pdf">www.global2015.net/file/global2015sdg\_indicators.pdf</a> Global2015 e.V., Trautenaustrasse 5, 10717 Berlin, Germany Phone +49 (0)30 96 534 777 <a href="https://www.Global2015.net">www.Global2015.net</a>



